

Office of Hawaiian Affairs
560 No. Nimitz Highway, Suite 200
Honolulu, HI 96817

Joint Meeting of the Committees on
Asset and Resource Management and
Beneficiary Advocacy and Empowerment

MINUTES of MEETING OF April 15, 2015

TRUSTEES PRESENT:

TRUSTEE ROWENA AKANA, CHAIR ARM COMMITTEE
TRUSTEE JOHN WAIHE'E, IV, CHAIR BAE COMMITTEE
TRUSTEE LEI AHU ISA
TRUSTEE HAUNANI APOLIONA
TRUSTEE CARMEN HULU LINDSEY
TRUSTEE COLETTE MACHADO

TRUSTEES EXCUSED:

TRUSTEE ROBERT LINDSEY
TRUSTEE DAN AHUNA
TRUSTEE PETER APO

BOT STAFF:

BETHANN AHSING
KANANI SOUZA
LOUISE YEE-HOY

DAVIS PRICE
LEHUA ITOKAZU
NATHAN TAKEUCHI

HAROLD NEDD
REYNOLD FREITAS
MELISSA WENNIHAN

ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF:

KAMANA'OPONO CRABBE, CEO
ERNEST KIMOTO, CC

KAWIKA BURGESS, COO
KAWIKA RILEY, CAD

HAWLEY IONA, CFO

CHRIS LUM LEE, PROG
PAULETTE HEDEMARK, PROG

MOMILANI LAZO, CEO
LISA ASATO, COMM

NANCY KING, TAP
CLARITA BARRETTO HIRONAKA

GUESTS:

RODNEY LEE, PKF PACIFIC HAWAII LLP
GINO SOQUENA, LABORERS' UNION LOCAL 368
PAUL COLEMAN, UH INSTITUTE FOR ASTRONOMY
RICHARD HA, HAMAKUA SPRINGS
HERRING KALUA
GÜNTHER HASINGER, UH INSTITUTE FOR ASTRONOMY
VICKY HOLT TAKAMINE, 'ĪLIO`ULAOKALANI COALITION
CHERYL BURGHARDT
CHRISTINE GAL
HINALEIMOANA WONG-KALU

PAUL SHIRAGA, PKF PACIFIC HAWAII LLP
SAM RHOADS
HEATHER MARIA KALUNA, UH GRAD STUDENT
ALAN TOKUNAGA, UH INSTITUTE FOR ASTRONOMY
CLYDE HAYASHI, HAWAII LACET
ROY GAL, UH INSTITUTE FOR ASTRONOMY
BEN MANUEL
ANDREI SHERSTYUK, UH INSTITUTE FOR ASTRONOMY
WALLACE ISHIBASHI

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Akana called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. Trustees present are Ahu-Isa, Akana, Apoliona, Hulu Lindsey, Machado, and Waihe'e, constituting a quorum of six (6) trustees.

II. COMMUNITY CONCERNS

Gino Soquena, Laborers' Union Local 368, spoke in support of the Thirty Meter Telescope (TMT) on Mauna Kea.

Sam Rhoads, spoke in strong support of the TMT.

Paul Coleman, UH Institute for Astronomy, spoke in support of the TMT.

Heather Maria Kaluna, beneficiary, spoke in support of the TMT.

Richard Ha, spoke about his concerns of safety on Mauna Kea. He also spoke in support of the TMT.

Trustee Machado said Richard, thank you for your direct words that we need to be as straight forward as possible so we don't add onto the misunderstanding on OHA's actions. You said, "No false hope OHA." I think this is what our beneficiaries are asking us to do. And the fact that we're going to revisit our actions at the time of 2009 and clarify each role will allow the three new Trustees an opportunity to weigh in so we ask that you folks be patient. We are under tremendous pressure and you know compassion and the heart is there for the people. It's just like a lightning rod.

Alan Tokunaga, UH Institute for Astronomy, spoke in support of the TMT.

Herring Kalua, beneficiary, spoke about the need for prayer to resolve the issues surrounding Mauna Kea and encouraged everyone to speak from the heart.

Clyde Hayashi, Hawaii Lacet, spoke in support of the TMT.

Chair Akana said, I myself and I know many others around the table support the labor unions and we support the fact that you allow our people to have work, especially on the Big Island, when sugar went out, pineapple went out, Big Island is very depressed, especially Hilo area so we're really cognizant of that and support that. I have to say that, for me personally, the issues I have are with the University and with the State of Hawaii because of the dollar a year leases allowing these people to sublease and the millions and billions they have collected that our beneficiaries have not benefitted from and the fact that on the mountain right now there are some telescopes that are not operational. It is the responsibility of the University and the State, if the University does not comply, to remove those things. Those are eye sores and so my concerns is not with the telescope itself or objection to science it is an objection to the abuse that the University has had and done with the lands. And for a dollar a year? It's egregious. So for us as advocates for our people this is what we need to be addressing and so it is not about a personal issue against any of the workers or unions or the telescope itself. It is really the abuse of power that the University has had and the State has allowed them to have over the lands and what they've done with those lands and they've mismanaged them. So this has to be addressed in a very serious way. No more talking while we're gonna wait six months, we're going to talk, talk, talk. No, I do think that our board needs to work in that direction as advocates for our people, for all of our people and certainly our workers on the Big Island will benefit, hopefully, from what we do, so I thank you for taking the time and just know that we do support your workers.

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, spoke in support of the TMT.

Roy Gal, UH Institute for Astronomy, spoke in support of the TMT.

Chair Akana said I've heard that people pay thousands of for minutes to view those telescopes.

Roy Gal, UH Institute for Astronomy, said no individual can buy time on the telescopes. No entity can buy time on the telescopes. You become a scientific partner, and when you do that, you have to contribute to the operating cost. If a telescope costs a million dollars a year to operate and you come in as a ten percent partner, you will get ten percent of the observing time, but nobody makes money off of that. You can't more telescope time than exists. Nobody buys it. They come in as a partner. You don't just contribute money to the operations, you have to contribute scientifically to the development of cameras, the future of the telescope and scientific direction. So it's a partnership that has shares and those shares basically goes to the operating costs of the telescope.

Chair Akana said and who are the partners?

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, said I think this is a very important point to understand so sorry that I interjected. So the National Science Foundation is funding science everywhere. Not just astronomy, but ships, polar stations, and so on. And the also fund new instruments that go on the telescopes, like the Keck telescope for instance. It's a twenty-year-old telescope, but every two or three years new instruments are coming because development of technologies are going very fast and these instruments are very expensive. They cost five, ten million dollars. So the National Science Foundation is funding parts of these instruments, but they say if I give you this money, you also have to give the rest of the American astronomers access to the telescope time and so there is this calculation that they give you a hundred thousand dollars for one night that you give back to the community, but this is actually not just the telescope time, and they fund an instrument that costs ten million dollars. So it's not just that they pay for the time, they also pay for an instrument that everybody else is using. So they are increasing the value of the telescope and so it is not a one dollar per second, it is actually a much more involved calculation. If the Keck telescope is partnering with the, for instance Yale University, they are partnering with Swinburne in Australia, they're partnering with Australia National University. These Universities come in and they also pay one hundred thousand dollars per night that they get access to the telescope. But again, it's not just a night because this money is used to improve the telescope. So for instance, right now, the Keck telescope has to repair the mirrors and it's a ten million dollar project to repair the mirrors and this money that the partners are bringing in is actually used to keep the value of the telescope up and the observing time is not the central part so if we say that one second costs one dollar, which is roughly the equivalent, then this is not just money for the observing time, but it's actually to keep telescopes up in a partnership.

Kamana'opono Crabbe, Ka Pouhana/CEO said so in summary, based on an MOU, all of the partners are contributing funders and that funding goes to the ongoing operations of the facility and if there's additional partners, that funding still goes through the maintenance and so forth.

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, said and the operations and improvements. There's an investment budget that keeps the facilities so to speak to the top notch facility which otherwise would not happen.

Kamana'opono Crabbe, Ka Pouhana/CEO said who are the partners for the current TMT? You mentioned Japan, Canada.

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, said for the current TMT it is Cal Tech, the California Institute of Technology, it's the University of California, the whole system, it is Canada, Japan, China, and India. And the University of Hawaii is getting access to the telescope, we are getting seven and a half percent of the observing time and honestly, I personally tried to raise money so that we could actually get a larger share of the telescope so that we could actually be the same size as partners like Cal Tech, University of California.

Kamana'opono Crabbe, Ka Pouhana/CEO said I just want to clarify, as this gentleman has shared, is that the tax payers of Japan, so the Japan government has contributed to the funding of the telescope.

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, said yes.

Kamana'opono Crabbe, Ka Pouhana/CEO said so it would be same for Canada, China and India, that their government is paying for the development.

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, said in the same way as the National Science Foundation is paying for telescopes in Chile or half paid for some telescopes on Mauna Kea.

Kamana'opono Crabbe, Ka Pouhana/CEO said so would the Cal Tech University or the University of California, are the Universities paying for that or that is coming from the National Science Foundation?

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, said no, it's the universities, from their tuition, but they are also rich universities that have a lot of endowments so they are paying from their endowments. They are non profit organizations., so they are almost like a government.

Kamana'opono Crabbe, Ka Pouhana/CEO said can you share what the total investment for the TMT is?

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, said one point three billion dollars for the construction and then it's roughly thirty million dollars operation every year.

Trustee Hulu Lindsey said do we have any Hawaiians using the telescope?

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, said yes.

Trustee Hulu Lindsey said one?

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, said two. To educate astronomers is a very, very competitive task and we are extremely pleased that with our very few Native Hawaiian astronomers in the world, I only know of three I believe, and Paul Coleman is one sitting here and next month we will have one more, which is Heather Kaluna, so we are committed to bring Native Hawaiians in the STEM pipeline, this is one of the reasons why we start from school, high school and undergraduate. We really would like to see more Hawaiians graduate as astronomers and this is very important for us.

Kamana'opono Crabbe, Ka Pouhana/CEO said can you share more about the "Think Fund," in terms of clarify what that is and how that money is spent for scholarships, specifically for Native Hawaiian students and how many Native Hawaiian students benefit from it?

Günther Hasinger, Director of the UH Institute for Astronomy, said the Think Fund is one million dollars a year and it's distributed in two trunch, one two hundred thousand goes to the Pauahi Foundation. Three quarters goes to Hawaii Community Foundation and one quarter goes to the Pauahi Foundation. The first trunch of this has actually

just been assigned. I think last week they have given out the first grants and there are various layers of grants. I think there is one grant where teachers can apply to and there are other grants where organizations can apply to. And actually what we learned yesterday, they gave a trunch of two hundred thousand last week and they actually raised three hundred thousand more from the community. The Think Fund is used as a kind of starting fund which is then matched by other communities. So it is a multiplier. It's not just the one million. I think in the end there will be more than one million. We have already seen three hundred thousand more coming in than expected so it's a huge multiplier machine.

Heather Maria Kaluna, beneficiary, said I just want to clarify your question about how many Hawaiians get access to the telescope now. Part of the program we lead through the University is the "High Star" program which interacts with high school students throughout the state and some of those students have been students from Kamehameha Schools. Kumu Tom Chun who was a professor at Kamehameha Schools has worked as a large partner in this program and these students get to use the telescope , primarily the Faulkes Telescope on Haleakalā, Maui. But they actually get to operate it. They learn how to use it. They learn how to reduce the data and so it more than just me a Paul. I just wanted to clarify that.

Trustee Ahu Isa said I don't think this thing is about the money part. It's all the culture. First I want to thank the four hundred emails that the Trustees got this morning in opposition. I just want to acknowledge the beneficiaries out there because I know you're watching us, live streaming. Today UH's Board of Regents have a meeting, eleven thirty this morning at UH Hilo. The only item on the agenda, Management of Mauna Kea and the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, but the thing that UH Hilo Chancellor Donald Straney walked Regents through the agenda. They're talking about the full environmental impact statement, the EIS, and its approval in 2009 and 10 by then Governor Linda Lingle. He mentioned that the Mauna Kea Management Board approved the proposal but on the condition that the Regents approve the sublease in open session. Conditional approvals like this should be a red flag for the subsequent subleasing body to look closer at this proposal and call to action. Had the Board appreciated this call to action and fully vetted the proposal with greater public outreach, the sublease may not have been granted. So it's more about the spiritual part, what Mauna Kea means to the people and not so much, I know we're talking a lot about money here. Also, the EIS was not really fully done. Trustee Akana, you are cited here in this article too, so thank you, Chair.

Vicky Holt Takamine, `Īlio`Ulaokalani Coalition, spoke against the TMT.

Ben Manuel spoke against the TMT.

Andrei Sherstyuk, UH Institute for Astronomy, spoke in favor of the TMT.

Christine Gal spoke in support of the TMT.

Wallace Ishibashi spoke against the misinformation regarding the TMT and asked OHA to lead both sides to a final resolution.

Hinaleimoana Wong-Kalu spoke about how the TMT issue has unified the Hawaiian community to take a stand and express themselves. She also spoke about how the issue has gone beyond Mauna Kea.

RECESS

BEGIN at 11:27 a.m.

END at 11:44 a.m.

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

There were no ARM/BAE minutes to approve.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

A. ARM Analyst Report: Best practices to help approve Budget Requests.

This item was deferred to the next ARM Committee meeting on April 29, 2015.

B. ARM Analyst Report: Priority list for budget decision making.

This item was deferred to the next ARM Committee meeting on April 29, 2015.

C. ARM/BAE# 15-01: Fiscal Biennium 2016-17 Community Grant Recommendations.

After discussion between Chair Akana and Ka Pouhana/CEO Kamana'opono Crabbe, this item was deferred to the Joint ARM/BAE Committee Workshop on April 28, 2015.

V. ANNOUNCEMENTS

There were no announcements.

VI. ADJOURNMENT

Trustee Machado MOVED, SECOND by Trustee Hulu Lindsey to adjourn the meeting.

Chair Akana said there being no objections the motion is adopted.

Meeting adjourned at 12:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Nathan Takeuchi, Aide
Committee on Asset and
Resource Management



Trustee Colette Machado, Chair
Committee on Resource Management



Trustee John Waihe'e IV, Chair
Committee on Beneficiary Advocacy and
Empowerment

Approved: RM-BAE meeting on February 24, 2016.